



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

APPROVED MINUTES

March 6, 2018, 8:30 a.m.
Committee Room, 2nd Floor, City Hall
101 City Hall Plaza, Durham, NC

I. Call to Order

Chair Jordan called the meeting to order at 8:32 a.m.

II. Roll Call

Members Present:

Joseph Jordan, Chair
Matt Bouchard
Jonathan Dayan
Katie Hamilton
Tom Kreger
Wanda Waiters

Excused Members Absent:

Le'Andre Blakeney
Tad DeBerry
Joe Fitzsimons

Staff Present:

Sara Young, Planning Assistant Director
Grace Smith, Planning Supervisor
Karla Rosenberg, Planner
Terri Elliott, Clerk
Don O'Toole, City Attorney's Office

III. Adjustments to the Agenda

None.

IV. Approval of Summary Minutes for February 6, 2018

MOTION: Approve the Minutes from February 6, 2018 (Bouchard, Dayan 2nd).

ACTION: Motion carried, 6-0

V. Swearing-In of Witnesses

Chair Jordan read the opening HPC statement, and asked if there were any early dismissals required by Commission members or Commission members who might have a conflict of interest with the cases presented today. No conflicts of interest were noted, and no early dismissals were requested.

The Clerk to the Board administered the oath to all Citizens and staff who wished to speak at today's meeting.

VI. Certificates of Appropriateness

After the oath was given, Ms. Rosenberg asked that all staff reports and materials submitted at the meeting be made part of the permanent record with any additions, deletions, and or corrections that may be necessary. All Commission members concurred.

- a. **Case COA1800002 – 911 North Mangum Street – Accessory Structure** - The applicant proposes to remove two non-historic accessory structures and construct a new accessory structure in their place. Details regarding the proposal can be found in the application materials.

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Ms. MacLeod spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Ms. MacLeod gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 911 North Mangum Street – Accessory Structure.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application.

MOTION: Mr. Dayan made a motion the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1800002, 911 North Mangum Street – Accessory Structure:

- The applicant is proposing a new accessory structure on a landmark property.
- The new structure will be located at the far rear corner of the lot, and will measure 24 by 48 feet, with a front porch measuring 10 feet deep.
- The structure will be constructed with cementitious fiberboard siding (smooth side facing out), decorative wood composite trim, six-inch pressure-treated wood porch columns, and asphalt roof shingles.
- The windows will consist of double-hung, two-over-two, aluminum clad wood windows, and the doors will consist of a solid wood front-entry door and a double barn-type door of painted oriented strand board (OSB) with trim.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed accessory structure is consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and is consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1800002, 911 North Mangum Street – Accessory Structure, *with the following conditions:*

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein. (Bouchard, Waiters 2nd)

ACTION: Approved, 6-0

- b. **Case COA1800004 – 1314 Arnette Avenue – New Construction and Site Work** – The applicant proposes to construct a new primary structure on a newly subdivided and currently vacant lot as well as to install a new accessory structure and a gravel driveway.

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Mr. Arthur spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Mr. Arthur gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 1314 Arnette Avenue- New Construction and Site Work.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application with a tree-related modification to motion.

MOTION: Mr. Bouchard made a motion the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1800004, 1314 Arnette Avenue – New Construction and Site Work:

- The applicant is proposing the construction of a new two-story primary structure, a one-story accessory structure, and a gravel driveway.
- Both structures will use beveled cementitious fiberboard siding, standing seam metal roofing, and two-over-two aluminum-clad wood windows.
- Three trees larger than 12 inches diameter at breast height (DBH) will be removed prior to construction, trees located adjacent to the planned driveway if damaged or diseased shall be replaced with trees that will mature to that size, as recommended and approved by the Urban Forester, the remaining trees will be protected under the tree loss prevention standard specified in UDO section 8.3 and the attached protocol.
- The gravel driveway will be 12 feet in width, terminating beside the house in a parking pad; it will be edged with concrete pavers.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed new construction and site work are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically the guidelines listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1800004, 1314 Arnette Avenue – New Construction and Site Work, *with the following conditions:*

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein. (Bouchard, Waiters 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 6-0

- c. **Case COA1800010 – 1109 Worth Street – Addition, Modifications, and Site Work** – The applicant proposes to correct changes made without a COA (e.g., windows, cladding, rear addition, and porch roof configuration) by the previous owner as well as to build a new rear addition. The property was recently purchased by the applicant.

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Mr. Finley spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Mr. Finley gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 1109 Worth Street – Addition, Modifications, and Site Work.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application without reconstruction of chimney.

MOTION: Ms. Waiters made a motion the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1800010, 1109 Worth Street – Addition, Modifications, and Site Work:

- The applicant is proposing an addition, modifications, and site work for a contributing structure.
- Original wood siding on the west side elevation is deteriorated beyond repair and will be removed; cementitious fiberboard siding will be applied with the smooth side facing out on all four sides of the structure, of a size, profile, and reveal to match the original wood siding.
- New triple-grid wood windows in a six-over-six configuration and wood trim will be installed in all original window openings on street-facing and side elevations, matching the size, proportion, and trim details of original windows as per photographic evidence.
- An original center brick chimney will not be reconstructed.
- A new addition will measure 465 square feet and will consist of a parged cement masonry unit (CMU) foundation, cementitious fiberboard siding, wood windows, and architectural roof shingles to match the rest of the house.
- Concrete driveway strips will be installed along the existing dirt driveway along the west side of the front yard.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed additions and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Preservation Local Review Criteria, specifically the guidelines listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1800010, 1109 Worth Street – Addition, Modifications, and Site Work, *with the following conditions:*

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein. (Waiters, Dayan 2nd)

ACTION: Approved 6-0

VII. Old Business

VIII. New Business

- a. Administrative COA updates
- b. Announcements and Concerns

- i. Commission members will continue to review proposed updates to Local Review Criteria, provide feedback, and propose additional changes. Staff will plan a retreat to discuss proposed changes within the next 90 days.
- ii. Staff will begin planning for a CLG training and/or Commission training to be held in Durham.
- iii. Commissioners are encouraged to attend this year's Regional CLG training in Chapel Hill on May 18, 2018.

IX. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 10:08 a.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Terri Elliott, Clerk
Historic Preservation Commission